June 25, 2021

The Honorable Connie Leyva  
Chair, Senate Education Committee  
State Capitol, Room 2083  
Sacramento, CA 95814

Re: Letter of Opposition - AB 22 (McCarty)

Dear Senator Leyva,

Each child and family has unique strengths and needs. This is why California has long embraced “parent choice” — which aims to ensure families have as many affordable child care options as possible to fit their particular preference. While we appreciate the intent of AB 22 to ensure all four-year-olds have access to a no-cost high quality early learning experience, AB 22 unfortunately does not take into account the need for free child care in a variety of enriching child care settings.

We are thrilled that California received nearly $4 billion earlier this year\(^1\) in federal relief funds to help build the availability and affordability of child care. Before the Covid-19 pandemic, licensed child care was available for only 24.5% of children with working parents in California.\(^2\) With 327,744 spaces temporarily or permanently lost since the beginning of the pandemic,\(^3\) the scarcity of child care is now much more dire. The federal funds will bring greatly-needed relief to help some child care providers reopen and remain open, and give a limited number of parents more affordable child care options. However, this federal money greatly falls short of rebuilding child care programs that were already fragile before the pandemic.


Accordingly, we must oppose AB 22 as currently drafted for the following reasons:

1. **Transitional Kindergarten Does Not Meet The Developmental Needs of All Four Year Olds**

We appreciate that some parents prefer Transitional Kindergarten (TK) for their four-year-olds. Meanwhile, many parents prefer having their children cared for in a setting with multiple early age groups, sometimes with their younger or older siblings. Moreover, a great number of four-year-olds are thriving in their current community-based family child care home, preschool or child care center setting. A school campus environment does not fit the developmental needs of many four-year-olds.

Children have also had to carry a lot in their young lives in the past year. They are enduring the stress of online learning, being isolated, and trauma from witnessing loved ones get sick and die. This upcoming school year they will have to readjust again to in-person learning after a year online. More than ever, they need to be cared for in a stable, loving environment with as few disruptions as possible. Children should not be forced to shuttle between various early care settings, sometimes all the way across town, because the only free option for their parents is TK. Families should have the opportunity to choose a child care program where their child feels most comfortable and their child’s needs are met.

2. **Transitional Kindergarten Does Not Meet The Needs Of Working Parents Who Need Affordable Child Care Most**

The pandemic has hit people with the fewest resources and families of color the hardest. The majority of front-line essential workers earn low wages, less than $14.68 per hour. They include workers in “food production and preparation, retail operations, home care, the movement and distribution of goods, and janitorial services;” most of these jobs require people to work early mornings, evenings, and weekends.4 The majority of these workers are Latinx, Black, Asian and other non-White race/ethnic groups.5 In order for parents, especially essential workers we all depend on, to keep working or return to work, our state needs to allocate significant state funds to ensure no- or low-cost child care options are offered in a variety of settings, during parents’ working hours, and that support the best interest of children’s healthy development. With the added stress of the economy reopening at full capacity, families will have to figure out their new normal. Parents need familiar and trustworthy child care options. Adding more state funding to a part-time, part-year program such as TK, especially at a time when so many parents need flexible full-time, year-round care more than ever is nonsensical.

When parents are offered a free TK option, many must make the hard decision about whether to keep their child in a setting from where they are thriving or uproot their child to a school setting they may not be ready for. The typical 4-hour per day TK program, Monday through Friday, forces parents to figure out how they can cobble together various forms of child care to make this free option work for them.

---


5 Id.
A parent’s ability to work and provide for their family is also critical to a child’s healthy development. Trying to figure out how to make a part-time TK schedule accommodate their work schedule or not being able to work at all because of lack of affordable child care options are major stressors on a parent. Children internalize this stress, which often directly impacts their well-being and academic success.

3. **AB 22 Unjustly Usurps Additional Ongoing, Guaranteed Funding from the General Fund**

Proposition 98 (“Prop 98”), passed by voter initiative in 1988, establishes a minimum funding guarantee for programs that support California’s public education system. The Legislature added Child Care and Development Services Act (“CCDSA”) programs into the Prop 98 minimum funding guarantee in 1989, because it acknowledged both academic and social benefits of child care and that child care is an integral aspect of public schools and necessary to its purpose.⁶

In 2011, in the midst of a catastrophic recession, the Legislature enacted trailer bill language to implement a broad range of education budget reductions.⁷ The trailer bill created Education Code section 41202.5, which excludes CCDSA programs from Prop 98’s minimum funding guarantee, with the exception of part-day preschool and the After School Education and Safety program.

Each year since 2011, child care advocates must fight hard to adequately fund the child care programs cut from Prop. 98. Lawmakers are forced to make difficult decisions on how to balance the many needs and requests — both child care and non-child care related — for how general child care dollars must be spent.

At a time when families and child care providers, particularly people of color, are in crisis and need child care more than ever, the Governor’s May Revise budget proposal does not appear to allocate any General Fund money outside of Prop 64 funding for the general child care programs; the very programs that offer the flexible, non-traditional hours families so desperately need. Meanwhile, **AB 22 guarantees ongoing General Fund money on top of the already guaranteed General Fund Prop. 98 money that the TK program currently receives. Moreover, this bill adds an additional adjustment for grades 1-3 based on TK pupil enrollment.** No general child care program has such significant guaranteed state funding streams. Not only is this provision unfair, it unjustly impacts the many families with limited resources who are already struggling to find affordable child care.

4. **AB 22 Will Decimate California’s Child Care System**

Due to the high cost of caring for an infant, child care programs rely on serving a range of age groups. If four year-olds are pulled out to attend TK at the public schools, the cost of infant care will skyrocket, and child care programs will close. We cannot assume that all child care providers can take on more 0-3 year olds to make up for the loss of four year-olds. This is impractical because many programs would

---

⁶ *California Teachers Association v. Hayes*, 5 Cal.App.4th 1513, 1520 n. 3 (1992) (discussing at length the legislative history of California Education Code section 8203.5); *see also* Chapter 1394, Statutes of 1989, §1.

⁷ Chapter 43, Statutes of 2011 (AB 114).
need to get relicensed and receive specific training to accept younger children. Some providers simply want to continue to care for older children, not babies and toddlers. Additionally, this bill would create the need for more qualified staff which are already difficult to recruit and retain, and create challenges for non-LEA based providers whose wages are much lower than at school districts.

Makinya Ward, who has served Bay Area families for over a decade as a child care center owner and many more as a teacher asserts:

I’ve dedicated my life to supporting families and partnering with parents. I’ve certainly been challenged during the pandemic and when I was going to shut down like many schools did, a parent said, if you close I don’t know what I’ll do. She’s a nurse. That gave me the will to figure things out and clean and distance to support her and our community at large. Now, after I’ve risked everything, down to my health, AB 22 may destroy my dream of teaching young children and my livelihood. Should the preschool age children be taken from my program I, along with many other providers, will not be able to keep our doors open and our joy of preparing three- and four-year-olds for their school careers will be taken away. I’ve been on the front lines along with many private centers and this feels like we’re being discarded. Like what we do in our communities means nothing. We are people, we are women, and even more specifically, many providers are women of color. This can ultimately wipe out the fragile care system. It may appear as a no brainer, but CA would be trading one problem for another. A mixed delivery system is the only way to go on this – not to destroy community based child care.

**Recommendation: A Successful TK Proposal Must Be Open to All Child Care Providers**

Our communities are struggling to recover from the pandemic. Essential workers, including teachers and school staff, are demanding child care for their young children as a condition to return to work. We are all well aware that nurturing care for babies and toddlers is critical for the positive brain development that gets them ready for school. The injustice is that thousands of families languish on child care waiting lists and only “1 in 9 children eligible for subsidized child care and development programs in California were enrolled in a program that could accommodate families for more than a couple hours per day and throughout the entire year.”

Existing early care programs, particularly those serving infants and toddlers, are severely underfunded. Child care subsidy reimbursement rates are dismally low, especially with regard to pay for infants and toddlers because of higher staff ratios and extra costs such as diapering, materials, and need for constant supervision. Many child care settings recoup their costs by also caring for older children. By

---

making TK the only no-cost child care option for parents, programs offering care to mixed age groups, including four- and five-year-olds, will become even more deficiently funded.

We appreciate Assemblymember McCarty and Assemblymember Wicks for meeting with the Child Care Law Center and some of our other ECE partners to discuss our concerns about AB 22. Child Care Law Center has submitted proposed amendments to the Author and Senate Education Committee that we worked on with our partners and are based on feedback from child care providers, child care center directors, and parents. These amendments, particularly the most comprehensive one with tracked changes to AB 22, will create a true mixed-delivery system, allowing all providers to participate in TK, provide parents a real choice to select the setting that works best for their family and meets the unique needs of their children, and deliver on the goal of truly universal transitional kindergarten.

In order to build an equitable child care system, the state must start with allocating significantly more guaranteed, ongoing funding for the most underfunded child care programs — family child care homes, child care centers, and family, friend and neighbor care. This is how we will create a more seamless support system for children from the beginning of life to preschool and beyond.

Sincerely,

Laurie Furstenfeld
Co-Director of Legal & Legislative Advocacy, Child Care Law Center

Radha Mohan
Executive Director, Early Care and Education Consortium

Linda Asato
Executive Director, CA Child Care Resource & Referral Network

Mary Ignatius
Statewide Organizer, Parent Voices California
Kym Johnson  
Executive Director, BANANAS, Inc.

Monica Walters  
CEO, Wu Yee Children’s Services

Kate Shaheed  
Executive Director, Saint Vincent’s Day Home

Gloria Davis  
Executive Director, Girls Club of Los Angeles

Beatriz Leyva-Cutler  
Executive Director, Bay Area Hispano Institute for Advancement, Inc. (BAHIA)

Melanie Traynor  
Executive Administrator, Duck’s Nest Preschool

Melinda Frizzell  
Executive Director, Adventures in Learning LLC
Elena Mannwieler  
Owner/Executive Director, Storyland School

Colleen Duran  
Owner/Director, Colleen's Cuddle Bugs Inc.

Wen Ma  
Owner, Knowledge Tree Children’s Academy

Bree Johnson  
Director/Owner, The Imaginarium Learning Center

Deepak Mudakavi  
Director, Safari Kid Inc.

Ron Gustavson  
CEO, Care Campus

Saovaros Diehl-Hope  
Chief Executive Officer, Renu Hope Foundation
Colleen H. Mullendore
School Administrator, Destiny Christian Preschool

Cassandra Y. Hall
Wynn Memorial Learning Center

Crystal Edwards
CEO/Director, Emagine U At Play Preschool

Kristine Rohm
Preschool Director, Immanuel Lutheran Preschool

Sarah Bedford
Director, Human Services Dept., City of Oakland Human Services Dept.

Carol Barona
Owner, Kids ‘n things, Inc.

Caitlin Schmitt
Caitlin Schmitt
Director, Marin Enrichment

Norene Curry
Owner/Licensee, Little Sprouts Preschool

YinYin Mar
Owner/Director, Nature’s Gift Preschool
Renee S. Herzfeld
Executive Director, Community Child Care Council (4Cs) of Alameda County

Linda Brown
Director, Sunny Acres Preschool

Diana Kong
Executive Director, True Sunshine Preschool Center

Lynette Bulick
Owner/Head Teacher, The Country Preschool

Sue Britson
Executive Director, Step One School

Anne Kwon
Executive Director, Chinatown Community Children’s Center

Amy Sanchez
Owner, Raggedy Ann & Andy Preschool

Jenny Reese
Director, Monte Vista Presbyterian Preschool
Luis Arenas
Director of Children & Family Services, The Unity Council

Sarah Hicks-Kilday
Director, ECESF

Clarissa Doutherd
Executive Director, Parent Voices Oakland

Scott Ayers
Owner, Spectrum Montessori

Lauri Miller
Director, Redwood Garden Preschool

Suzette L. Smith
Head of School, Diablo Valley Montessori School

Betsy Nachman
Former Preschool Director, Griffin Nursery School

Michelle Harmon
Head of Early Education, St. Mary’s School

Claire Peterson
Director, St. Mark’s Nursery School

Dorothy Stewart
Executive Director and Owner, Old Firehouse School

Kellie Gillespie
Owner/CEO, Kellie’s Academy for Kids Child Development Center

Joanne McLaughlin
Preschool Director, St. Andrew’s Preschool
Patricia Young
Director, Patti’s Preschool, Inc.

Joyce L. Robinson
ECE Consultant, Crazy Quilt Solutions

Dave Esbin
Executive Director, Californians for Quality Early Learning

Kimberly Coedona
Owner/Director, Plumfield School

Maria Gallo
Head of School, The Lake School

Lisa Hansen
Owner, Growing Brilliant Preschool

Mandy Erickson
Director, Cypress Learning Tree, Inc.

Rosemarie Madawala
Director, Rossmoor Children’s Center, Inc.

Anna Martinez
Director, Belmont Shore Children's Center

Carol Thomson
Executive Director, All Five

Jessica Chang
Administrator, Enchanted Castle Schools (LA & OC)

Makinya Ward
CEO, Kids Konnect

Michelle Barreras
Head of School, Bay Area Discovery Museum - The Discovery School

Gigi Harwell
Owner, KidsPark

Lupe R. Peterson
Executive Director, Kinderland Preschool Inc.
Michelle Nitzen  
Owner/Director, Little Treasures Preschool

Saprina R. Rodriguez  
CEO, Imagination Station Preschool & Childcare Center

Piyush Jalan  
Owner, Primrose School of Livermore

Holly Gold  
Owner, Rockridge Little School

Cynthia Villa  
Director, Bakersfield Parent Nursery

Regina Wolf  
Owner/Director, Bear Country Preschool

Amy Haewon Kim  
Director, Dongshin Christian Preschool

Angie Esparza  
Director of Education, Bakersfield Play Center

Yohana Quiroz  
Chief Operations Officer, Felton Institute

Connie Hodges  
Owner/Director, Alphabet Soup Children’s Learning Center

Brenda Myers  
Preschool Director, Calvary Chapel Yorba Linda

Mahta Marashi  
Owner/Director, Orkidz Preschool

Nancy Martling  
Executive Director, Albany Preschool

Mehdi Shafiei  
CFO/Vice President, Sunflowers Daycare Inc.

Robyn Solansky
Child Development Coordinator, Thermalito Union School District

Angela Lopez
Center Director, LPC Child Development Center

Karen Lundberg
Director, United Methodist Child Development Center

Linda Bednar
Director, Jan Peterson Child Development Center

Khalida Ziaullah
Preschool Director, Islamic Academy of Riverside

Rene Rodriguez-Baker
Owner, Town & Country Preschool

Marci Carey
Director, Foothills Preschool

Leonor Guerrero
Director, Early Learning Preschool

Kim Sa
Director, Little Me Preschool and Enrichment Center

Tammy Nichols
Director, Harvest Christian Preschool

Lois Porter
Assistant Manager, Emeryville Child Development Center

Alexa Rubbo
Director, Carden School of Fresno

Judy Powell
Owner, Carden Kids Preschool

Beverly Enewold
Owner, Carden Kids Preschool

Denise Ecroyd
Owner/Director, Kountry Kids Preschool
Coralie Lectere Sobhani  
School Director & Owner, Au Beau Sejour French Preschool.com

Cyndee Nieves  
Mission Neighborhood Centers, Inc.

Theodora D. Speraw  
Executive Director, The Growing Place Child Development Center, Inc.

Melanie R. Santana  
Executive Director, Mission Child Care Consortium Incorporated

Sharon D. Johnson  
Administrator, Krayola Korner School Readiness

Lynda MacDonald  
Director, King of Glory Preschool

Csilla Horvath  
Head of School, My Own Montessori

Diana Davis  
Director, Broadway Children’s School of Oakland, Inc.

Kiki Deng  
School Administrator, Growing Tree Montessori Preschool

Amy Sanchez  
Site Supervisor, St. Paul’s Enrichment Program

Kelly O’Lague Dulka  
Chief Executive Officer, Hively

Eric Alexander  
Director, Montessori West

Melanie Mueller  
Executive Director, YMCA East Bay

cc: Honorable Members, Senate Education Committee  
The Honorable Kevin McCarty  
Lynn Lorber, Chief Consultant, Senate Education Committee
Roger Mackensen, Consultant, Senate Republican Caucus
Joey Freeman, Chief Deputy Legislative Secretary, Office of Governor Gavin Newsom